Honorable John Kerry, Secretary of State  
United States Department of State  
2201 C Street NW  
Washington, DC 20520

September 21, 2015

Dear Secretary Kerry,

In 2013 the United States took the important step of being the first country to ratify the Minamata Convention on Mercury. We appreciate your leadership on reducing global mercury pollution and are writing to strongly urge the U.S. to reverse an outdated federal policy that is both impeding mercury reduction efforts domestically and contrary to the position taken by the U.S. during the negotiations.

The goal of controlling the anthropogenic releases of mercury throughout its lifecycle is the primary driver that shaped obligations under the Convention. These obligations, which will be phased in over time, include: supply and trade controls on mercury; mercury-added product phase outs and phase downs; reducing mercury use in processes; and air emission controls for major sources of mercury pollution.

Dental amalgam is now one of the largest consumer uses of mercury in the U.S. today. According to the latest U.S. Geological Survey report, 18-30 tons of mercury is used in dental amalgam each year accounting for between 35% and 57% of mercury use in 2010.

During the treaty negotiations, the Department of State expressed support for reducing and eventually phasing out dental amalgam use:

“The United States supports further consideration of dental amalgam by the Intergovernmental Negotiation Committee such that the agreement is able to achieve the phase down, with the goal of eventual phase out by all Parties, of mercury amalgam upon the development and availability of affordable, viable alternatives.”

This Department of State (DoS) position is reflected in the final Convention text, as Annex B of the Convention requires Parties to “phase down the use of dental amalgam”, using two or more measures identified in the Annex.

However, the Food & Drug Administration (FDA) apparently takes the opposite view, as expressed when it reclassified dental amalgam as a Class II medical device in a rule published on August 4, 2009. In assessing the potential impacts of the reclassification, the FDA states:

“We are unable to estimate possible changes in exposure that may result from this rule. Dentists may use dental amalgam for some patients for whom they may not have used the device previously, and decide not to use the device for other patients for whom they have used the device. However, any change away from use of dental amalgam is likely to result in negative public health outcomes (delayed dental treatments or increased costs of treatment); while there would be a decrease in mercury exposure, there is no evidence that there would be any reduction in adverse effects associated with mercury.”
Accordingly, FDA’s position as articulated in 2009 and unaltered since that time is fundamentally at odds with the Convention’s provisions to “phase down the use of dental amalgam,” as well as the U.S. Government’s position taken during the negotiations. The difference in approach reflects the Convention’s consideration of dental amalgam’s full life cycle, and the comprehensive approach in the Convention “to protect the human health and the environment from anthropogenic emissions and releases of mercury…”

Announcing support for the Convention, the DoS said that, “The United States has already taken significant steps to reduce the amount of mercury generated and released into the environment, and can implement Convention obligations under existing law.” However, unless the FDA’s views and associated policies toward the phase down of dental mercury are changed, it may undermine comprehensive mercury reduction efforts in the U.S. and also could send the wrong message to other Parties to the Convention.

Therefore, we respectfully recommend that DoS take a leadership role in encouraging FDA to reduce amalgam use. With the Environmental Protection Agency proposing a rule to reduce dental mercury pollution, the responsibility for phasing down amalgam use squarely falls on FDA.

Thank you again for being a strong leader on reducing mercury pollution. We look forward to meeting with you or your staff to discuss this further. Please feel free to contact Michael Bender (email: mercurypolicy@aol.com) if you or your staff have questions.

Sincerely,

Pamela Miller, Executive Director
Alaska Community Action on Toxics
Anchorage, AK

Jane Williams, Director
California Communities Against Toxics
Rosamond, CA

Robert Zimmerman, Executive Director
Charles River Watershed Association
Weston, MA

Kathy Curtis, Executive Director
Clean and Healthy New York
Albany, NY

Robert Wendelgass, President & CEO
Clean Water Action
Washington, DC

Amber Meyer Smith
Clean Wisconsin
Madison, WI
Bill Magavern, Policy Director  
**Coalition for Clean Air**  
Los Angeles, CA

Sharon E. Lewis, Executive Director  
**Connecticut Coalition for Environmental Justice**  
Hartford, CT

Veronica Eady, Vice President  
**Conservation Law Foundation**  
Boston, MA

Mike Belliveau, Executive Director  
**Environmental Health Strategy Center**  
Portland, Maine

Sue Phelan, Director  
**GreenCAPE**  
West Barnstable, MA

Marcia Cooper, President  
**Green Newton**  
Newton, MA

Rachel L. Gibson, JD, MPP, Director, Safer Chemicals  
**Health Care Without Harm**  
US and Canada

Deanna White & Kathleen Schuler, Co-Directors  
**Healthy Legacy Coalition**  
Minneapolis, MN

Bill Walsh, Executive Director  
**Healthy Building Network**  
Washington, DC

Cheryl Osimo, Executive Director  
Margo Simon Golden, President, Board of Directors  
**Massachusetts Breast Cancer Coalition**  
Rockland, MA

Julia Blatt, Executive Director  
**Massachusetts Rivers Alliance**  
Boston, Massachusetts

Cathy Buckley, Chair  
**Massachusetts Sierra Club**  
Boston, MA
Cheryl Nenn
Milwaukee Riverkeeper
Milwaukee, WI

Pete Didisheim, Senior Director of Advocacy
Natural Resources Council of Maine
Augusta, ME

David Lennett, Senior Attorney
Natural Resources Defense Council
Washington, DC

Niaz Dorry, Coordinating Director
Northwest Atlantic Marine Alliance
Gloucester, MA

Melanie Houston, Director of Environmental Health
Ohio Environmental Council
Columbus, OH

Chris Hagerbaumer, Deputy Director
Oregon Environmental Council
Portland, OR

Sejal Choksi-Chugh, Executive Director
San Francisco Baykeeper
Oakland, CA

F. Ann Devlin, President
Saugus Action Volunteers for the Environment (SAVE)
Saugus, MA

Charlie Winterwood, Chair
Sierra Club - National Toxics Committee
San Francisco, CA

Richard R. Vanderslice, Co Chair, Steering Committee
Sustainable Sudbury
Sudbury, MA

Doug Karpa, Legal Program Director
Turtle Island Restoration Network
Olema, CA
Matt Prindiville, Executive Director
UpStream
Rockland, ME

Paul Burns, Executive Director
Vermont Public Interest Research Group
Montpelier, VT

International

Jeffer Castelo Branco
ACPO – Associação de Combate aos Poluentes
Santos – SP – Brasil

Dr. Elena Manvelyan, MD, PhD, President
Armenian Women for Health and Healthy Environment NGO
Yerevan, Armenia

Najwa Bourawi, President
APEDDUB Bizerte
Tunisia

Richard Gutierrez, JD, L.M., Executive Director
Ban Toxics!
Quezon City, Philippines

Ram Charitra Sah, Executive Director
CEPHED
Kathmandu, Nepal

Gilbert KUEPOOU, Ph.D., Coordinator/Executive Director
CREPD- Research and Education Center for Development
Yaoundé, Cameroon

Fernando Bejarano G.
Centro de Análisis y Acción en Tóxicos y sus Alternativas
Mexico

Griffins Ochieng
Centre for Environment Justice and Development
Nairobi, Kenya

Shahriar Hossain, Ph.D.
Environment and Social Development Organization
Bangladesh

Leticia Baselga
Ecologistas en Acción
Sevilla, Spain
Jeremy Wates, Secretary General  
European Environmental Bureau  
Brussels, Belgium

Lisette van Vliet, Ph.D., Senior Advisor on Chemicals & Chronic Disease Prevention  
Health & Environment Alliance  
Brussels, Belgium

Josh Karliner, International Coordinator  
Health Care Without Harm  
Berkeley, CA

Yuyun Ismawati  
Indonesia's Toxics-Free Network  
Indonesia

Dr. Naji Kodeih, Policy advisor/toxic campaigner  
IndyACT  
Beirut, Lebanon

Andrea Carmen, Executive Director  
International Indian Treaty Council  
San Francisco CA, USA

Dr. Olga Speranskaya and Manny Calonzo, Co-Chairs  
International POPS Elimination Network  
Berkeley, CA & Sweden

Dominique Bally, Programme Director  
Jeunes Volontaires pour l'Environnement  
Abidjan, Côte d'Ivoire

Servando Pérez-Domínguez, President  
Mercuriados  
Spain

Jean-Pierre Havard, Chairman  
NGO Solidarité Guyane (Mercury analysis in French Amazonia)  
Le Mans - France

Juliet Pratt, Vice President  
Oceania  
New Zealand

Anthony Akpan, President  
Pan African Vision for the Environment  
Lagos, Nigeria
Dr. Mahmood A. Khwaja, Senior Adviser (Chemicals)
Sustainable Development Policy Institute
Islamabad, Pakistan

Leslie Adogame
Sustainable Research and Action for Environmental Development
Lagos, Nigeria

Margaretha Molius
Swedish Association of Dental Mercury Patients
Trollhättan, Sweden

Zuleica Nycz
TOXISPHERA Environmental Health Association
APROMAC Environment Protection Association
AMAR Environment Defense Association
Brazil

Monika Frielinghaus
VHUE e.V.
Neunkirchen, GERMANY

Charlie Brown
World Alliance for Mercury Free Dentistry
Washington, DC, USA

Michael Bender and Elena Lymberidi-Settimo, Co-coordinators
Zero Mercury Working Group
Brussels, Belgium and Montpelier, VT USA

cc Ms. Sylvia Burwell, Secretary
U.S. Health and Human Services
Hubert H. Humphrey Building
200 Independence Avenue, S.W.
Washington, D.C. 20201

Dr. Stephen Ostroff, M.D., Acting Commissioner
U.S. Food & Drug Administration
10903 New Hampshire Avenue
Silver Spring, MD 20993

Ms. Gina McCarthy, Administrator
Environmental Protection Agency
1200 Pennsylvania Ave, N.W.
Washington, DC 20460

Ms. Judith G. Garber, Acting Assistant Secretary
U.S. Department of State
Bureau of Oceans International Environmental and Scientific Affairs
2201 C Street NW
Washington, DC 20520
Endnotes


vii The United States joins Minamata Convention on Mercury, Hails Agreement as a Tremendous Step Forward in Protecting People in the United States from Transboundary Mercury Pollution http://www.state.gov/e/oes/eqt/mercury/